**Brothers Karamazov Study Guide Discussion Points (Rebellion)**

*Read these Study Guide Questions then put them aside and read the whole chapter. Then pick up these Study Guide Questions again, find each quote or passage and think about how you would answer them. For simple quotes, contemplate what they mean.*

“If we’re to come to love a man, the man himself should stay hidden because as soon as he shows his face – love vanishes.” (Ivan, p. 237)

“… a man’s face often prevents many people, who are as yet inexperienced in love, from loving him.” (Alyosha, quoting Zosima, p. 237)

*Why does Ivan narrow his topic to the suffering of children?*

“Indeed, people speak sometimes about the ‘animal’ cruelty of man but that is terribly unjust and offensive to animals, no animal could ever be so cruel as man, so artfully, so artistically cruel.” (Ivan, p. 238)

“…the Turks are very fond of sweets…”? (Ivan, p. 239)

“I think that the devil does not exist, and man has therefore created him, he has created him in how own image and likeness.” (Ivan, p. 239)

“As well as God, then.” (Alyosha, p. 239)

What does each mean by their statements? Do you agree or disagree with them?

*Why didn’t the shepherds take good care of Richard? (p. 239 – 240)*

*What does Richard say right before his execution? Why does he say this?*

*Why does Ivan tell Alyosha this story?*

“… but that’s only a horse; God gave use horses so that we could flog them.” (Ivan, p. 241) Irony aside, what are the assumptions behind this statement?

*In reference to the flogging of children and the legal defense put up by their parents by lawyers, Ivan says, ironically, “Ah, if I’d have been there, I’d have yelled out a suggestion that they establish a scholarship in honor of the torturer …!” What does Ivan mean by this? (p. 241)*

*Why doesn’t Alyosha ask Ivan to stop recounting the horrible cases of suffering when Ivan offers to stop? (p. 242) What do you make of Alyosha’s exclamation, “Shoot him!” after Ivan tells the account of the General? (p. 243)*

“Oh, with my pathetic, earthly Euclidian mind, I know only that there is suffering, that none are to blame, that all things follow simply and directly, one from another; that everything flows and finds its level – but all that is just Euclidean jibberish, of course, I know that, and of course I cannot consent to live by it!” (Ivan, p. 244) *What does he mean by a “Euclidian mind” and why can ne not accept what it tells him?*

“Listen: if everyone must suffer, in order to buy eternal harmony with their suffering, pray tell me what children have got to do with it?” Why does he then say, “I absolutely renounce all higher harmony.” (Ivan, pp. 244 – 245)

*Ivan says, of the mother of the boy killed by the general’s dogs,* “Let her forgive him for herself, if she wants to, let her forgive the tormentor her immeasurable maternal suffering; but she has no right to forgive the suffering of her child who was torn to pieces, she dare not forgive her tormentor, even if the child himself were to forgive him!”  *What does this mean? Do you agree or disagree?*

“I call on you – answer me: imagine that you yourself are building the edifice of human destiny with the object of making people happy in the finale, of giving them peace and rest at last, but that you must inevitably and unavoidably torture just one tiny creature, that same child who was beating her chest with her little fist, and raise your edifice on the foundation of her unrequited tears – would you agree to be the architect on such conditions?” *Would you?*

*Does The End Justify the Means?*

**Study Guide Discussion Points (The Grand Inquisitor)**

What does the Virgin ask of God in the little monastery poem?

In the context of the previous chapter (Rebellion), what does Ivan think of her request and what is Ivan’s point in bringing up the monastery poem?

On p. 247 Ivan says, “HE comes onstage in it…” Who is HE and how do we know who HE is?

What had the Grand Inquisitor (GI) been doing the previous day? Why does Ivan bring up the “fifteen centuries” reference? Ivan’s “poem” or tale is set in what city and country? There are only two main characters – who are they?

How would you describe Ivan’s literary treatment of Jesus? Is he mocking or satirizing him? Distorting him in some way? What miracles does Jesus perform?

WHY does the GI arrest Jesus? What does it mean that Jesus transferred his authority to the pope? (p. 251)

The main issue of debate between these two is between what two principles which can be seen as conflicting goals of humanity? (What does the GI say is the enemy of happiness?)

On p. 253, the Inquisitor refers to the “tens of thousands” versus the remaining millions. Who are these two groups? On p. 253, the Grand Inquisitor says, “This deceit will constitute our suffering, for we shall have to lie.” What does this mean?

Why is it (p. 253) that the GI says, “Oh never, never will they feed themselves without us! No science will give them bread as long as they remain free.”?

In the struggle over these two principles, three questions are posed dealing with “miracle, mystery, and authority”. For each question, something is being denied. Without using any of those three words (“miracle, mystery, and authority”), and in no more than five words, explain what is being denied by the denial of… miracle, mystery, and authority.

Explain the quote on pp. 255 – 256 “And since man cannot bear to be left without miracles, he will go and create new miracles for himself, his own miracles this time, and will bow down to the miracles of quacks, or women’s magic, though he be rebellious, heretical, and godless a hundred times over.”

In 12 words or less, according to the GI, why didn’t Jesus come down from the cross when challenged to do so by his critics?

On p. 257, the GI says, “For a long time now – eight centuries already – we have not been with you but with *him*…” Who is “we”? Who is “*him*”? What specific event is the GI referring to when he says that it has been “eight centuries already”?

Explain (top of 257) “…we… teach them that it is not the free choice of the heart that matters, and not love, but the mystery, which they must blindly obey, even setting aside their own conscience.”

What is anthropophagy (p. 258)? On p. 258, the GI says, “And it is then that the beast will come crawling…” Who or what is the Beast?

What system of government does the GI imply that Jesus advocates?

For the GI, what is the purpose of Government?

Should the deceivers of humanity be judged, even if they have deceived humanity to make it happy?

Should the purpose of government be to provide these three things (“miracle, mystery, and authority”), or not?

What is Ivan planning on doing when he turns 30? Why?

Why does Ivan accuse Alyosha of plagiarism?

Who “wins” the debate? (Your answers will determine the answer key.)